

The Dulce Report

1. The Dulce Report: Investigating Alleged Human Rights Abuses at a Joint US Government-Extraterrestrial Base at Dulce, New Mexico An Independent Report by © Dr. Michael E. Salla September 25, 2003, DrSalla@exopolitics.org www.exopolitics.org

2. Abstract - Dr. Paul Bennewitz is an electronics specialist who in late 1979 began to film, photograph, and electronically intercept what appeared to be extensive UFO/ET activity and communications that he traced to the vicinity of the Archuletta Mesa on Jicarilla Apache Reservation land near the town of Dulce. Based on the collected evidence Bennewitz concluded that an underground extraterrestrial (ET) base existed near Dulce that played a role in both cattle mutilations and abduction of civilians. In 1980, the Air Force Office of Special Intelligence (AFOSI) began investigating Bennewitz's evidence, and this eventually led to its disinformation campaign to discredit Bennewitz. Bennewitz's subsequent electronic evidence and field research alleging extensive human rights abuses were occurring at the Dulce underground base became associated with the AFOSI disinformation campaign. Most UFO researchers concluded that Bennewitz had been too influenced by disinformation to be taken seriously. In this report, I investigate Bennewitz's claims regarding massive human rights abuses by ETs at an underground base at Dulce, and his belief that this was a joint US government/ET base that was the site of a significant violent confrontation between military forces and resident ETs in 1979. I begin my analysis of whistleblower testimonies by reviewing whistleblower protection laws, and how National Security statutes eliminate this protection for whistleblowers that disclose classified information such as secret underground military installations. I then review various whistleblower testimonies that involved the disclosure of information about the existence of an underground base at Dulce used by ET's. I subsequently explore whether the evidence for the alleged human rights abuses and a military conflict having occurred at Dulce are persuasive. I then examine criticisms raised against the Dulce underground base hypothesis. Using further whistleblower testimony, I further examine how a secret base at Dulce and other government facilities are funded without US Congressional and Executive Office oversight. Finally, I make recommendations on how to address the alleged human rights abuses identified in this report and the political implications of the purported joint government-ET underground base at Dulce.

3. About the Author - Dr. Michael E. Salla has held academic appointments in the School of International Service, American University, Washington DC (1996-2001), and the Department of Political Science, Australian National University, Canberra, Australia (1994-96). He taught as an adjunct faculty member at George Washington University, Washington DC., in 2002. He is currently researching methods of Transformational Peace as a 'Researcher in Residence' at the Center for Global Peace (2001-2003) and directing the Center's Peace Ambassador Program. He has a Ph.D. in Government from the University of Queensland, Australia, and an MA in Philosophy from the University of Melbourne, Australia. He is the author of *The Hero's Journey Toward a Second American Century* (Greenwood Press, 2002); co-editor of *Why the Cold War Ended* (Greenwood Press, 1995) and *Essays on Peace* (Central Queensland University Press, 1995); and authored more than seventy articles, chapters, and book reviews on peace, ethnic

conflict, and conflict resolution. He has conducted research and fieldwork in the ethnic conflicts in East Timor, Kosovo, Macedonia, and Sri Lanka. He has organized a number of international workshops involving mid to high-level participants from these conflicts. He has a website at www.american.edu/salla/. In January 2003, he began publishing a series of scholarly papers dealing with the political implications of a possible extraterrestrial presence on the planet ([websiteURL:www.exopolitics.org](http://www.exopolitics.org)). These papers are being published as *Exopolitics: Political Implications of the Extraterrestrial Presence* (forthcoming Dandelion Books, 2004). The Dulce Report: Investigating Alleged Human Rights Abuses at a Joint US Government-Extraterrestrial Base at Dulce, New Mexico Introduction [1] Dr. Paul Bennewitz is an electronics specialist who in late 1979 began to film, photograph, and electronically intercept what appeared to be extensive UFO/ET activity and communications over the Manzano mountain range near Albuquerque, New Mexico. He traced this UFO/ET activity to the vicinity of the Archuleta Mesa on Jicarilla Apache Reservation land near the town of Dulce. Bennewitz had earlier researched cattle mutilations in the region and civilians who claimed to have been abducted by extraterrestrials. Based on his film, photographic and electronic evidence, and his field research Bennewitz concluded that an underground extraterrestrial (ET) base existed near Dulce that played a role in both cattle mutilations and abduction of civilians. In 1980, Bennewitz submitted his evidence to the nearby Kirtland Air Force base to alert officials to the possibility that ET races were a threat to the nearby Manzano Nuclear Weapons Storage Area. The Air Force Office of Special Intelligence (AFOSI) quickly became involved in investigating Bennewitz's evidence, and this eventually led to what credible sources conclude was a disinformation campaign to discredit Bennewitz. Bennewitz's subsequent electronic evidence and field research alleging extensive human rights abuses were occurring at the Dulce underground base became associated with the AFOSI disinformation campaign. Most UFO researchers concluded after Bennewitz had suffered a nervous breakdown in 1987 and the AFOSI disinformation campaign became public knowledge, that Bennewitz had been too influenced by disinformation to be taken seriously. The strongest support for Bennewitz's claims are a number of individuals claiming to be 'whistleblowers' who in their capacity as former employees of corporations performing a variety of military contracts worked at or learned of the Dulce base, and subsequently revealed aspects of what had occurred there. A recurring feature of these whistleblower statements is the testimony of a violent conflict in 1979 between US military personnel and ETs at the base that led to a significant number of military fatalities. This seemed to confirm Bennewitz's claim of such a military conflict and raises the possibility that the conflict's cause was related to his allegations of human rights abuses. Furthermore, Bennewitz's evidence provided an example of how money illegally siphoned from the US economy into 'black budget' programs related to an ET presence, estimated to be as high as 1.1 trillion dollars annually, was being used. [2] Was Bennewitz just an overzealous UFO researcher that accidentally tapped into highly classified Air Force research and development projects, or was he an electronics genius who single-handedly uncovered the existence of a joint US government-

4. ET underground base where ET's conducted gross human rights violations on abducted civilians? Seeking clear answers to these questions has spurred a number of books, articles, and internet websites. [3] The quality of answers has varied greatly since all who have written on Dulce have mixed primary source materials with secondary sources that cross-reference one

another without confirming the validity and origins of sources. This has led to much confusion and uncertainty for those seeking clear answers to what was occurring under the ground at Dulce since most of the available Dulce material takes the form of hearsay and speculation. A more scholarly effort of analyzing the primary source material available on Dulce is needed to help answer key questions about the alleged base at Dulce, and the human rights violations that were reported to be occurring there, by ETs with US government complicity. This report is an effort to fulfill the need for a scholarly analysis of the primary source material on what has occurred and may be still occurring, at Dulce and elsewhere in the US and around the planet. In this report, I begin by investigating Bennewitz's claims regarding massive human rights abuses by ETs at an underground base at Dulce, and his belief that this was a joint US government/ET base that was the site of a significant violent confrontation between military forces and resident ETs in 1979. I begin my analysis of whistleblower testimonies that support Bennewitz's claims by reviewing federal and state whistleblower protection laws, and how National Security statutes eliminate this protection for whistleblowers that disclose classified information such as secret underground military installations. I then review various whistleblower testimonies that involved the disclosure of information about the existence of an underground base at Dulce used by ET's. I subsequently explore whether the evidence for the alleged human rights abuses and a military conflict having occurred at Dulce are persuasive. I then examine criticisms raised against the Dulce underground base hypothesis. Using further whistleblower testimony, I further examine how a secret base at Dulce and other government facilities are funded without US Congressional and Executive Office oversight. Finally, I make recommendations on how to address the alleged human rights abuses identified in this report and the political implications of the purported joint government-ET underground base at Dulce.

Paul Bennewitz and Evidence of a Joint Government-Extraterrestrial Base at Dulce

In the mid-1970's, a wave of cattle mutilations began occurring in New Mexico and Dr. Paul Bennewitz, a local Albuquerque businessman and electronics specialist, became keenly interested in the phenomenon.[4] In 1979, he did some field trips with Gabe Valdez, a well-known New Mexico State Trooper to investigate some of these mutilations, and they concluded that the mutilations were not caused by anything 'natural'. Bennewitz soon began noticing an unusual amount of UFO activity in the Northern New Mexico area. Using his film and photographic equipment, he began accumulating evidence of what appeared to be UFOs. [5] He then began intercepting radio and video transmissions that he believed were used by the UFOs and involved different ET races. He traced these transmissions to a base located under the Archuleta Mesa, near Dulce. Bennewitz believed he had identified the radio and video frequencies used for communications between the ET piloted ships and ground controller sat the underground Dulce base. Bennewitz then created a communication system that he believed enabled him to electronically communicate with what he now was convinced were ET piloted ships flying to and from the base. Furthermore, Bennewitz began to track the electronic frequencies ETs used to control individuals who had been abducted and implanted with miniature electronic devices. Bennewitz tracked down some of these individuals and conducted interviews on what they could remember of their ET encounters. Bennewitz eventually issued a report, Project Beta, in which he summarized the evidence of his filming, photographing, electronic interception, communications, and fieldwork:

5. combined with his electronic interceptions, video recordings, and communications he became convinced that they fit an overall pattern of ET deception, responsibility for cattle mutilations, and massive human rights violations of abducted civilians. [9]Bennewitz's electronic interceptions and interviews led to him quickly learning much about the activities at the Dulce underground base, the extensive ET presence there, and the sizable number of civilians abducted and forcibly taken to the base. His electronic intercepts and communications provided him some basic information that a military conflict had occurred at the Dulce base between ET races and US military personnel. [10] Bennewitz subsequently reported his findings to the AirForce Office of Special Intelligence (AFOSI) at the nearby Kirtland Air force in October 1980 believing the ETs presented a threat to the nearby Manzano Nuclear Weapons Storage Area. In an official report signed by Major Thomas Cseh on October 28, 1980, and later released under the Freedom of Information Act, Major Cseh wrote: On 26 Oct 80, SA [Special Agent] Doty, with the assistance of JERRY MILLER, GS-15, Chief, Scientific Advisor for Air ForceTest and Evaluation Center, KAFB, interviewed Dr. Bennewitz at his home in the Four Hills section of Albuquerque, which is adjacent to the northern boundary of Manzano Base.... Dr. Bennewitz has been conducting independent research into AerialPhenomena for the last 15 months. Dr. Bennewitz also produced several electronic recording tapes, allegedly showing high periods of electrical magnetism being emitted from Manzano/Coyote Canyon area. Dr. Bennewitz also produced several photographs of flying objects taken over the general Albuquerque area. He has several pieces of electronic surveillance equipment pointed at Manzano and is attempting to record high-frequency electrical beam pulses. Dr. Bennewitz claims these Aerial Objects produce these pulses. ...After analyzing the data collected by Dr. Bennewitz, Mr. MILLER related the evidence clearly shows that some type of unidentified aerial objects were caught on film; however, no conclusions could be made whether these objects pose a threat to Manzano/Coyote Canyon areas. [11]When AFOSI took no action, Bennewitz approached the then New Mexico Senator, Harrison Schmitt, who demanded to know why Bennewitz's claims were not being investigated. Frustrated by the lack of official support for his discoveries, Bennewitzissued a detailed report titled Project Beta and continued to accumulate data on ET operations in the area. [12]Based on his intercepted electronic communications, Bennewitz revealed in his Project Beta report the following about the size of the base and the ET population: The total alien basing area apparently contains several cultures, (all under the designation unity) and is approx 3km wide by8km long and is located in the middle of nowhere on the Jicarilla Indian Reservation west of Dulce, NM. Based on the number of ships presently in this area, the total alien population is estimated to be at least 2,000 and most likely more.[13]Bennewitz's work had attracted much attention and soon led to a covert effort by AFOSI to discredit him. In a 1989 MutualUFO Network conference, a prominent UFO specialist, William Moore, caused an uproar when he openly declared that in 1982he had been co-opted into this effort, and began passing on information about Bennewitz's activities to AFOSI and played a role in feeding disinformation to Bennewitz. Moore described the events as follows:... when I first ran into the disinformation operation... being run on Bennewitz... it seemed to me... I was in a rather unique position. There I was with my foot... in the door of a secret counterintelligence game that gave every appearance of being somehow directly connected to a high-level government UFO project, and, judging by the positions of the people I knew to be

directly involved with it, definitely had something to do with national security! There was no way I was going to allow the opportunity to pass me by without learning at least something about what was going on. I would play the disinformation game, get my hands dirty just often enough to lead those directing the process into believing that I was doing exactly what they wanted me to do, and all the while continue to burrow my way into the matrix so as to learn as much as possible about who was directing it and why. [14]The public declaration by Moore confirmed that Bennewitz had, at least partially, succeeded in electronic monitoring of ET craft in the area, communicating with ETs at the Dulce base, and monitoring ET control of abductees in the area. This might help explain why AFOSI began what emerged as an intense covert effort to discredit Bennewitz. The basic strategy in the campaign by AFOSI was to suggest that the most egregious aspects of Bennewitz's claims - the Dulce base as a site where humans were abducted for genetic experiments, placed in cold storage, and even used as a food source for ETs - was disinformation rather than accurate reports of the nature of the ET presence in the Northern New Mexico area. Indeed Moore argued that by the time he met him in 1982, the bulk of Bennewitz's information was already disinformation fed by AFOSI. [15]Many UFO researchers despaired of finding the truth of what was happening at Dulce due to the fog of disinformation rumored to be circulating around Bennewitz, and the various activities orchestrated by AFOSI and/or other intelligence services that targeted Bennewitz and his supporters. [16] The dominant view was that Bennewitz was definitely on to something but had succumbed to beliefs that discredited his early and most persuasive work. One UFO researcher claimed that the disinformation was passed on through the intercepted communications: "Where the truth began and ended in the information collected by Bennewitz is debatable but one thing is, without doubt, true - the content of the intercepted messages certainly caused

6. Bennewitz to become a paranoid and deluded man who eventually suffered a colossal nervous breakdown in 1985." [17] The intensity of his investigations and the official response had a heavy personal toll on Bennewitz caused his nervous breakdown. He later withdrew entirely from any public discussion of the Dulce base and ended his involvement with UFO issues. Despite his controversial withdrawal from the UFO scene, Bennewitz's credibility as an undisputed electronics genius was not in question, and the extensive database of films, photos, and raw electronic communications data of UFO/ET phenomenon, was powerful evidence that something was occurring around the Archuleta Mesa. Aside from the raw physical evidence accumulated by Bennewitz, a number of whistleblowers have come forward to give further testimony and even physical evidence of an underground base at Dulce, and of ETs committing human rights violations on abducted civilians. Before analyzing whistleblower testimony concerning the Dulce underground base, I will point out the legal position of whistleblowers when disclosing classified information since this would help explain why comparatively few individuals have stepped forward to confirm the allegations of massive human rights abuses at Dulce and other joint government-ET underground bases. Whistleblowers and National Security 'Whistleblowers' have been described as courageous employees who often with the zeal of a martyr disclose unethical or criminal government/corporate practices that involve great damage to the public interest. [18] Often the short-term result for whistleblowers is the loss of jobs, reputation, economic security, and even life. A whistleblower can be defined as any employee of any branch of government or corporation that publicly discloses unethical or corrupt practices by a government

agency/corporation that violate the law and/or damage the public interest. There are an extensive series of state and federal whistleblower laws for those who come forward to disclose such practices and risk their own careers, reputations, and physical safety. [19] When it comes to employment in government agencies/corporations that involve working in projects with national security implications, whistleblower protection laws have some important qualifications as evidenced by the Basic Federal Whistleblower Statute concerning National Security Whistleblowers (5 USC 2302). [20] The relevant section of this Statute [5USC Sec. 2302. (8) (A)] concerns the prohibition of action taken against an employee (whistleblower) because of any disclosure of information that the employee believes is evidence of “a violation of any law, rule or regulation,” or “an abuse of authority, or “substantial and specific danger to public health or safety.” The relevant section then states the critical qualifying condition: “if such disclosure is not specifically prohibited by law and if such information is not specifically required by Executive order to be kept secret in the interest of national defense or the conduct of foreign affairs.” As evident in the qualifying statement, whistleblowers are not permitted to disclose information if such disclosure compromises national security. This means that if one is employed in a government agency and/or corporation working on a classified project with national security implications, such individuals do not receive protection under Federal Whistleblower Statutes for publicly disclosing classified information. Furthermore, if government/corporate employees sign contracts that permit severe penalties for disclosing classified information, such individuals essentially sign away their constitutional rights since they have no legal recourse to prevent the imposition of even the most draconian penalties. Consequently, if employees witness, for instance, egregious human rights abuses committed in the operation of classified projects, they have no legal protection if they choose to disclose this to the general public. One individual who apparently risked disclosing egregious human rights violations while working on a highly classified project is Thomas Castello. Thomas Castello & the Dulce Papers In 1987 an apparent whistleblower organized the release of 30 photos, video, and a set of papers to UFO researchers that were apparently physical evidence of a joint US government/extraterrestrial base two miles beneath the Archuleta Mesa, near the town of Dulce, New Mexico. The collection came to be called the ‘Dulce Papers’ and provided graphic evidence of the operations of this secret underground facility and appeared to provide powerful support to Bennowitz’s conclusions regarding activities at the underground base. [21] The Dulce Papers described genetic experimentation, development of human-extraterrestrial hybrids, use of mind control through advanced computers, cold storage of humans in liquid-filled vats, and even the use of human body parts as a nutritional source for extraterrestrial (ET) races. The papers provided possible evidence that humans were used as little more than laboratory animals by ET races working directly with different US government agencies and US corporations fulfilling ‘black budget’ military contracts in a joint base. If the papers were genuine, experiments and projects were being conducted that involved human rights violations on a scale that exceeded even the darkest chapters of recent human history. The individual responsible for assembling and releasing the Dulce Papers, Thomas Castello, claimed to have worked as a senior security officer at the base before ‘quitting’ the Dulce facility after a military confrontation that occurred in 1979 between elite US military personnel, base security guards, and resident extraterrestrials. The military confrontation he described has been dubbed the ‘Dulce Wars’ and a number of other

‘whistleblowers’ and UFO researchers have subsequently described similar incidents at Dulce or nearby that substantiate many of Castello’s claims. [22] In the time since he claims he left his Dulce employers in 1979, and subsequent release of the Dulce Papers in 1986, Castello gave a number of interviews and corresponded with UFO researchers before eventually vanishing from the scene. The transcripts of these interviews and

7. correspondence provides further ‘whistleblower’ testimony of events at the purported Dulce facility and the secret ‘war’ that occurred there. Thomas Castello claims to have served in the US Air force and specialized in military photography and video monitoring. He further claims to have served on a highly classified underground base near the Northern New Mexico town of Dulce. His background has been summarized as follows: In 1961, Castello was a young sergeant stationed at Nellis Air Force Base near Las Vegas, Nevada. His job was as a military photographer with a top-secret clearance. He later transferred to West Virginia where he trained in advanced intelligence photography. He worked inside an undisclosed underground installation, and due to the nature of his new assignment, his clearance was upgraded to TS-IV. He remained with the Air Force as a photographer until 1971 at which time he was offered a job with RAND corporation as a Security Technician, and so he moved to California where RAND had a major facility and his security clearance was upgraded to ULTRA-3. ... In 1977 Thomas was transferred to Santa Fe, New Mexico where his pay was raised significantly and his security clearance was again upgraded... this time to ULTRA-7. His new job was as a photo security specialist in the Dulce installation, where his job specification was to maintain, align and calibrate video monitoring cameras throughout the underground complex and to escort visitors to their destinations.[23] It is the extensive video monitoring that occurred at Dulce that apparently provided Castello the bird’s eye information he needed to learn what was occurring at the base and the human rights abuses that eventually led to his departure from the base and distribution of classified material. Castello’s claims are outlined in two sources, first are the Dulce papers themselves that presumably involved classified material taken from the base; and second, the interviews/correspondence Castello had with a number of UFO researchers. Much of Castello’s material has since been circulated on the Internet and has been incorporated in a book titled The Dulce Wars that was authored by a UFO researcher who uses the name ‘Branton’. [24] Officially confirming Castello’s employment, military and educational background, and therefore his status as a whistleblower has not been possible. This is possibly due to a practice that has been claimed to be standard for civilians who work under contract to corporations and/or military/intelligence agencies on classified projects involving ETs: the official removal of all public records of contracted employees as a security precaution in the event they intentionally or unintentionally publicly disclose what is occurring in such projects. For example, Dr. Michael Wolf claims to have been a former scientist and policymaker on ET affairs that began to serve from 1979 on the coordinating policy group for ET affairs, the Special Studies Group(PI-40) in the National Security Council. [25] In a series of interviews with the prominent UFO researcher, Dr. Richard Boylan, Wolf claimed that he was being directed by his superiors to participate in a controlled leak of information to the UFO community while providing a fallback of ‘plausible deniability’ for the government. [26] All public records of Wolf’s advanced university degrees and contractual services to different military/intelligence/national security branches of government were eliminated making it very difficult if not impossible to confirm his background and

substantiate the startling information he was releasing. He claimed that this removal of public records was 'standard practice' for all civilians employed by either corporations and/or the US military in clandestine projects involving ETs. [27] A further source confirming Wolf's description of the existence of such a 'standard practice' was Bob Lazar, a physicist who found that after leaving in 1988 the secret S-4 facility (Dreamland) in Nevada where his job was to reverse engineer the propulsion and power system of recovered ET craft, his birth certificate was no longer available at the hospital he was born at, along with the disappearance of his school, college, and all employment records – he simply ceased to officially exist! [28] It can now be suggested that a standard practice exists for civilians contracted to corporations and/or military/intelligence agencies whereby their employment and public records are removed as a security precaution against either public disclosure of ET related information as in the case of Bob Lazar or to maintain a highly controlled leak of information as in the case of Dr. Wolf. This means that confirming Castello's employment background and therefore his credibility, as a whistleblower is very difficult if possible at all. There are three possibilities for Castello's true identity and credibility as a whistleblower. The first is that he is who he claims to be, a whistleblower who worked at the base. The second is that he is using the name and identity of 'Thomas Castello' as a cover in order to reveal information on Dulce. In this case, he may be an 'insider' leaking information on abuses at the base who wishes to remain an anonymous whistleblower. The third, possibility is that Castello is a bogus identity created by an intelligence officer to disseminate disinformation that steers UFO researchers and the general public away from genuine military-related projects in the area. A number of UFO researchers were apparently able to get in contact with Castello before his eventual 'disappearance' in the late 1980s and were able to get answers to a series of questions. [29] According to both Branton and William Hamilton, fellow UFO researchers had personally met with Castello and could vouch for his existence and credibility. [30] While the list of contacts and personal interviews with Castello is not extensive, it does appear that he exists while casting doubt on, without eliminating, the third possibility that his identity was concocted by intelligence officers. It is this uncertainty that led to most UFO researchers not taking seriously Castello's claims that supported much of what Bennewitz had been earlier arguing and was now associated with a disinformation campaign led by Air Force Intelligence (AFOSI). In a later section, other whistleblowers will be cited who confirm many aspects of both Bennewitz's and Castello's claims indicating that the third possibility can be dismissed as the least likely possibility concerning Castello's identity. Consequently, it is worth exploring in some depth what Castello claimed to have experienced in the Dulce underground base since he provides the most extensive testimony of what may have occurred there.

8. In the Dulce papers and his personal testimonies Castello claims the existence of a seven-level underground facility that jointly houses humans and different extraterrestrial races in Dulce, New Mexico. Castello claims that the humans employed at the base comprised scientists, security personnel, and employees from various corporations who were servicing military contracts. [31] There were four extraterrestrial races he claimed worked at Dulce: the standard 'short' Grays' from Zeta Reticulum (approx 4ft in height); tall Grays from Rigel, Orion (7 ft); and Reptilian species either native to Earth or from the Draco star system in Orion (ranging from 6-8 ft). Castello claims that the earth-based Reptilians, who he described as the 'working caste', were led

by a winged Reptilian species he described as the Draco (ETs from Orion). [32] He said that the short grays (depicted in movies such as Close Encounters of the Third Kind) are subservient to the Draco Reptilians. Castello says he was employed as a 'Senior Security Technician' at the Dulce facility and that his primary job function was to sort out any security issues between the resident ET races and the human employees at the base. He described some of his job functions and the ET hierarchy in response to a question by Branton about how often he communicated with the different ET species: Since I was the Senior Security Technician at that base, I had to communicate with them on a daily basis. If there were any problems that involved security or video cameras, I was the one they called. It was the reptilian "working caste" that usually did the physical labor in the lower levels at Dulce. Decisions involving that caste were usually made by the white Draco. When human workers caused problems for the working caste, the reptoids went to the white Draconian boss and the Draco called me. At times, it felt like it was a never-ending problem. Several human workers resented the "no-nonsense" or "get back to work" attitude the working caste lives by. When needed, intervention became a vital tool. The biggest problem was human workers who foolishly wandered around near the "OFF LIMITS" areas of the "Alien Section." I guess it's human nature to be curious and to wonder what is past the barriers. Too often someone found a way to bypass the barriers and nosed around. The cameras near the entrance usually stopped them before they got themselves in serious trouble. A few times I had to formally request the return of a human worker. [33]Castello claimed that the different projects at Dulce involved reverse engineering of ET technology, development of mind control methods; and genetic experiments involving cloning and creating human-ET hybrids. Similar projects have been conducted at Montauk, Long Island, and Brookhaven laboratories[34] and have been the subject of a number of other whistleblower testimonies. [35] These projects were scattered among the seven levels of the Dulce underground base with the ETs occupying the deepest levels, five to seven. These lower levels were described by Castello as an extremely old series of natural caverns that had been used in the past by different ET races. In response to a question concerning the Cavern's origin, he stated: Nature started the caverns. The Draco [reptilian humanoids] used the caverns and tunnels for centuries. Later, through RAND Corporation plans, it was enlarged repeatedly. The original caverns included ice caves and sulfur springs that the aliens found perfect for their needs. [36]In describing the way command was shared at the joint base between the US government and the ET races, Castello said: The worker caste [Reptilian] does the daily chores, mopping the latex floors, cleaning the cages, bringing food to the hungry people, and other species. It is their job to formulate the proper mixture for the type one and type two beings that the DracoRace has created. The working caste work at the labs as well as at the computer banks. Basically speaking, the reptilian races are active at all levels of the Dulce Base. There are several different races of aliens that work on the east section of level six.... That section is commonly called "the alien section." The Draco are the undisputed masters of the 5-6-7 levels. The humans are second in command of those levels. [37]Castello says that he directly witnessed the products of the trans-species genetic experiments in the sixth level of the facility. Most disturbing was his discovery that humans were used as a kind of laboratory animal in the lowest level where they were placed in cold storage, used as test subjects in mind-control programs, and even used in genetic experiments. Castello wrote: "Level #7 is worse, row after row of thousands of humans and human mixtures in cold storage. Here too are embryo storage

vats of Humanoids in various stages of development. 'I frequently encountered humans in cages, usually dazed or drugged, but sometimes they cried and begged for help.'" [38]Castello claims he was told in his initial briefing that the humans suffered different forms of insanity and were being subjected to a range of high-risk medical procedures and mind control experiments designed to treat insanity. He claims that he and other human workers were exposed daily to signs that said: "This site does high risk advanced medical and drug testing to cure insanity, please, never speak to the inmates, it can destroy years of work." [39]Castello argues that he performed his duties without any great problem until he began to suspect that rather than being insane, the humans were normal civilians who were simply abducted to be used as laboratory animals by the Grey and Reptilian ET races:

9. I'm sensible, when doctors say don't speak to them, who was I to destroy the delicate situation? But one man somehow caught my eye. He repeatedly stated that he was George S---- and that he had been kidnapped and he was sure someone was searching for him. I don't know why he sticks in my mind, I found I was remembering his face, thinking he sure didn't look or sound insane, but many inmates said that. The next weekend I convinced a friend of mine, a cop, to run a check on the guy, saying I had a run-in with him and was curious. I didn't mention the base at all. It was a sickening feeling when the computer confirmed that George S. was missing. [40]It was the realization that the humans were ordinary civilians abducted from that led to Castello's decision to join a small number of other base personnel in helping free the trapped humans. It was another security officer that came to me saying he and some lab workers wanted an off-duty meeting at one of the tunnels [off the record]. Curiosity took over and I said OK. That night, about nine men showed up. They said they knew they were risking me turning them in but they wanted to show me some things they thought I should see. One by one they showed records that proved many inmates were missing people. There were newspaper clippings and even photos that they had somehow smuggled into the base. They hoped to smuggle them back out, without me turning them into the honchos. I could see the fear in their faces as they spoke. One man stated he would rather lose his life by trying than to lose his soul by not doing anything at all. It was that remark that turned the tide. I told them about George and the things I found out about him. After a few hours, we pledged to attempt to expose the Dulce Base. [41]Castello describes how the small band of human workers began to cooperate with some Reptilians from the worker caste who also had an interest in freeing the abducted humans in the deep levels. Eventually, Castello described how the elite Delta force contingent attempted to destroy the 'resistance movement': Ultimately, it ended when a military assault was initiated via the exit tunnels and they executed anybody on their list, human or reptilian. We fought back, but none of the working caste had weapons, nor did the human lab workers. Only the security force and a few computer workers had flash guns. It was a massacre. Everyone was screaming and running for cover. The halls and tunnels were filled as full as possible. We believe it was the Delta Force [because of the uniforms and the method they used] that chose to hit at shift change, an effort that killed as many as named on their list. [42]Castello quit the facility, he took along with him photos and a video recording eventually distributed to the general public as the Dulce Papers. Due to the importance of Castello's claims and the evidence he provided that appears to support much of what Bennewitz had concluded from his extensive electronic monitoring and field research, it is necessary to analyze any further whistleblower testimonies that independently

substantiate the Dulce underground base hypothesis. Was a Treaty Signed Between US Government Representatives and ET races? The first claim that needs analysis is Bennewitz's and Castello's contention that joint government-ET bases exist in the first place. This would imply some sort of formal treaty or agreement between US government representatives and ET races. There is significant whistleblower testimony that a treaty was signed between the Eisenhower administration and Grays from Zeta Reticulum as early as 1954. According to Dr. Wolf, the Eisenhower administration entered into the treaty with the so-called Grey extraterrestrials from the fourth planet of the star system Zeta Reticulum, but this treaty was never ratified as Constitutionally required. [43] Alluding to the same treaty signed by the Eisenhower administration, Col Phillip Corso, a highly decorated officer that served in Eisenhower's National Security Council wrote: "We had negotiated a kind of surrender with them [ETs] as long as we couldn't fight them. They dictated the terms because they knew what we most feared was disclosure." [44] The secret Treaty signed in 1954 between the Eisenhower administration and an ET race has been disclosed by a number of other 'whistleblowers' claiming former access to secret documents disclosing the existence of such a treaty. [45] Phil Schneider, a former geological engineer that was employed by corporations contracted to build underground bases wrote: Back in 1954, under the Eisenhower administration, the federal government decided to circumvent the Constitution of the United States and form a treaty with alien entities. It was called the 1954 Grenada Treaty, which basically made the agreement that the aliens involved could take a few cows and test their implanting techniques on a few human beings, but that they had to give details about the people involved. Slowly, the aliens altered the bargain until they decided they wouldn't abide by it at all. [46] The treaty has been argued to essentially lead to technology transfers between ET races and the US government in exchange for certain basing rights, and monitoring of ET abductions of US civilians. Col Phillip Corso believed that this treaty was essentially something that was imposed on the Eisenhower administration suggesting that the technology transfer would be exchanged for the ET harvesting the diverse genetic material available in the US. This genetic diversity was something that made the US a much more attractive treaty signatory than the more racially homogenous major powers of Russia and China.

10. It is likely that the administration reasoned that since the Grays had been abducting US civilians anyway, that the Treaty would provide them with a means of monitoring the abductions, and observing at close range what happened with the civilians who were part of the genetic experiments pursued by the Grays. The Grays were obliged to provide lists of abducted civilians, something that apparently did not occur and later became a source of friction between the Grays and US authorities. The treaty with the Grays from Zeta Reticulum presumably led to the creation of secret joint bases whose functions most likely included: technology exchange; mind-control experiments; monitoring genetic experiments of Grays; and collusion in the abduction of civilians for the various projects at these shared bases. The existence of both the Treaty and the joint base(s) with the Grays would have received the highest possible classification levels and would only have been known by a limited number of elected and appointed public officials. Consequently, whistleblower testimony supporting the existence of a secret treaty negotiated by the Eisenhower administration for technology transfers with an ET race suggests the possible construction of underground facilities where this could be done without public, congressional, or

foreign national scrutiny. Having laid the possible 'legal' foundation for a joint US government-ET underground facility, I now move to analyzing evidence supporting the existence of such a base. Based on the evidence presented so far it may be concluded that three possibilities stand out as the most likely explanations for what was occurring at Dulce. First, a top-secret joint ET-human facility exists at Dulce that is (or was) conducting projects that involve (d) the abduction of human subjects whose rights are (were) severely violated. Second, the Dulce base exists (or existed) but reports of horrific ET abuses of humans were part of a disinformation campaign designed to discredit Paul Bennewitz and any legitimate research into the ET activities and secret government projects being conducted at Dulce. A third possibility is that all the stories about Dulce are disinformation designed to deliberately steer serious investigation away from UFOs and to divide the UFO community. [47] Keeping these three possibilities in mind, I now examine whistleblower testimonies concerning an apparent military conflict that occurred at the Dulce base in order to determine which of these three possibilities is more accurate. The Dulce War The whistleblower testimonies supporting the existence of the Dulce base suggest that such a secret facility is indeed conducting a range of projects that focus on technology exchange, mind control, genetic experiments, and human rights abuse of abducted civilians. It is likely that one or more of these projects became an area of dispute between ET races and clandestine government organizations. This dispute led to military hostilities that became known as the 'Dulce War'. The precise cause of this confrontation remains unclear, however, what does emerge from the various testimonies is that it did occur and involved a significant number of fatalities involving US military personnel, Dulce security guards, and ET races. According to Castello, the Dulce military conflict began as a result of the growth of a resistance movement between both security guards and sympathetic ETs that desired to help imprisoned humans in the ET sections of the base. Eventually, 100 elite Delta force military personnel were sent to eradicate the resistance movement that began to threaten established security procedures at the joint base. This force suffered a number of fatalities and inflicted heavy casualties upon both resident ETs and base security personnel. The military confrontation at Dulce has been reported by other whistleblowers including Phil Schneider who worked as a geological engineer in the construction of the Dulce base, another underground base in the US, and other underground bases around the globe. Schneider gave the following details of his background and the existence of a military confrontation in 1995: To give you an overview of basically what I am, I started off and went through engineering school. Half of my school was in that field, and I built up a reputation for being a geological engineer, as well as a structural engineer with both military and aerospace applications. I have helped build two main bases in the United States that have some significance as far as what is called the New World Order [a UN-run world secretly controlled by 'tall Gray' ETs]. The first base is the one at Dulce, New Mexico. I was involved in 1979 in a firefight with alien humanoids, and I was one of the survivors. I'm probably the only talking survivor you will ever hear. Two other survivors are under close guard. I am the only one left that knows the detailed files of the entire operation. Sixty-six secret service agents, FBI, Black Berets, and the like, died in that firefight. I was there. [48] Schneider described the cause of the 1979 military confrontation as little more than an 'accident' that arose from drilling for a planned extension of the Dulce base: I was involved in building an ADDITION to the deep underground military base at Dulce, which is probably the deepest base. It goes down seven levels and over 2.5 miles deep.

At that particular time, we had drilled four distinct holes in the desert, and we were going to link them together and blow out large sections at a time. My job was to go down the holes and check the rock samples and recommend the explosive to deal with the particular rock. As I was headed down there, we found ourselves amidst a large cavern that was full of outer-space aliens, otherwise known as large Grays. I shot two of them. At that time, there were 30 people down there. About 40 more came down after this started, and all of them got killed. We had surprised a

11. Whole underground base of existing aliens. Later, we found out that they had been living on [in] our planet for a long time...This could explain a lot of what is behind the theory of ancient astronauts. [49]An important difference between Schneider's and Castello's versions is that Schneider did not refer to the underground base as a joint facility. He described it as a seven-level US military facility that had 'accidentally' been built on top of an ancient ET base. He believed that his job was to simply extend the existing base rather than attacking ET races for an undisclosed purpose. The unlikelihood that the Dulce facility was 'accidentally' built on an ancient ET base suggests that Schneider was only partly informed of the true nature of his mission and what was occurring on the lower levels. The more likely scenario was that Schneider had to assist US military forces to access the innermost layers of the Dulce facility, level 7, that had been closed off and where the true cause of the dispute lay. Sometime in 1993 Schneider quit working for his various corporate clients that serviced military contracts after becoming convinced of a plot by the tall Gray ETs to develop a New World Order dominated by the United Nations that they would be secretly controlling. He subsequently began a series of public lectures revealing the activities at the underground bases he helped construct and the role of extraterrestrial races in infiltrating national governments and being the true architects of a New World Order. Schneider gave a keynote lecture at a MUFON conference in May 1995 and was found dead in his apartment seven months later in January 1996. [50] Circumstances surrounding the death of Schneider and his autopsy reported many to declare that Schneider had been murdered for going public with his knowledge of ETs and the secret underground base. [51] Schneider's testimony, his clear knowledge of geological engineering, and his mysterious death all support his central thesis that an underground base exists at Dulce, and a military confrontation between ETs and elite US military forces occurred at the lowest level of this underground facility. Another 'whistleblower' that lends credence to the possibility that a firefight had occurred between US military forces and ETs in a secret underground base was Dr. Michael Wolf. Wolf's book *Catcher's of Heaven* described a firefight between ETs and elite US military forces that had occurred in 1975 at the Groom Lake, Nevada facility that may have been related to what occurred later at the nearby Dulce: The Greys shared certain of their technological advances with military/intelligence scientists, apparently often while prisoner "guests" within secure underground military installations in Nevada and New Mexico. The extraterrestrials have given the U.S. government some of their antigravity craft and a huge amount of fuel (element 115). On May 1, 1975, during one such technology exchange in Nevada, a demonstration of a small ET antimatter reactor, the lead Grey asked the Colonel in charge of the Delta Forces guarding the ETs to remove all their rifles and bullets from the room, (so that they would not accidentally discharge during the energy emissions.) The guards refused, and in the ensuing commotion, a guard opened fire on the Greys. One alien, two scientists, and 41 military personnel were killed. One guard was left alive to attest that the ETs apparently use

directed mental energy in self-defense to kill the other attacking Delta Forces. Dr. Wolf states that "this incident ended certain exchanges with (the Greys)." [52] There are important parallels with the 'Dulce war' in the description of the 'Nevada' confrontation described by Wolf, with that described by Castello and Schneider. In both cases, a significant number of US military personnel are killed after a confrontation with ET's. These parallels suggest either that Wolf was narrating an entirely different conflict, or the same conflict but with some inaccuracies intended to hide the true nature and location of the conflict between the US military and ET races. Some notable differences in the accounts are that Wolfe said that the ETs were 'prisoner' guests rather than sharing joint base facilities with the US. It is unlikely that ETs as 'prisoner guests' would participate in the kind of significant technology exchange described by Wolf. It is likely that Wolf's reference to the ETs as 'prisoner guests' was intended to hide the true extent of the cooperation between US military and ET races in a shared base that might lead to a connection being made with Bennewitz's claims regarding Dulce. This also casts doubt on whether the conflict did occur in Nevada in 1975 as Wolf writes, or whether he was alluding to the 1979 military conflict at Dulce, New Mexico. If the latter is the case, then Wolf was instructed by his superiors in the 'controlled release of information' to sow some inaccuracies (disinformation) into the information he was releasing that a firefight had indeed occurred at a shared Government-ET facility and the US had taken heavy casualties. Such a disinformation strategy would strengthen any fallback position of 'plausibility deniability' that the government could choose to take over the sensitive information released by Wolf. Wolf further disclosed in an interview that he had worked at the Dulce laboratory, thereby providing more confirmation for the existence of this secret underground base that is the key claim made by Bennewitz. [53] Another whistleblower that revealed evidence of the existence of a joint government-ET base and the 'Dulce military conflict' is Bob Lazar. Lazar worked for a few months in 1988 at the S-4 Nevada facility on reverse-engineering the propulsion and power system of ET craft. In an interview he described his background as follows: I have two master's degrees, ones in physics; ones in electronics. I wrote my thesis on MHD, which is magnetohydrodynamics. I worked at Los Alamos for a few years as a technician and then as a physicist in the Polarized Proton

12. Section, dealing with the accelerator there. I was hired at S-4 as a senior staff physicist to work on gravitational propulsion systems and whatnot associated with those crafts. [54] Lazar revealed that in his briefing prior to working on the ET craft he was required to read 200 pages of briefing documents in preparation for his job. [55] He recalled that the briefing document mentioned a battle between ETs and humans at a secret base in 1979. He said the conflict was caused by a security guard that tried to take a weapon in the ET area and resulted in fatal wounds to security personnel. Lazar's recollection of the briefing document he read in 1988 is very likely referring to the 1979 Dulce firefight. In sum, the strongest evidence for Bennewitz's claims regarding the Dulce base comes from Thomas Castello's testimony of his employment and defection from the Dulce underground base after witnessing human rights abuses; testimony of Phil Schneider who was directly involved in the Dulce firefight; important parallels with Michael Wolf's revelation of a firefight that may have occurred four years earlier at another underground base in Nevada and his admission of having worked at Dulce; Bob Lazar's recollection of a written briefing disclosing a 1979 firefight between ETs and security personal at a secret base; and the reports of abductees who underwent hypnotic regression and whose testimonies are

recorded in the book, *The Dulce Wars*. Furthermore, the disinformation campaign instigated against Bennewitz, and the mysterious death of Schneider after his going public on the existence of secret underground facilities, both lend circumstantial support to the view that there was sufficient basis to whistleblower claims concerning the existence of the Dulce underground facility, and possible gross human rights abuses occurring there. I can now return to the three possibilities mentioned earlier concerning Bennewitz's major claims of the existence of the Dulce base, a military conflict having taken place, and extensive human rights having occurred (or continuing to occur) at the base. The first possibility was that the evidence substantiates Bennewitz's claims. The second possibility was that Bennewitz's claims concerning ET abuses against civilian abductees were disinformation intended to steer researchers away from the existence of the base and/or a military conflict having taken place there. The third possibility was that Bennewitz's claims were compromised by disinformation intended to steer UFO researchers away from genuine sightings of UFOs. In order to determine which possibility is most plausible, I will now consider some of the criticisms made of Bennewitz's and others claims surrounding the Dulce base: Critique of the Dulce Underground Base Hypothesis

Ever since Bennewitz first began circulating his claims concerning the Dulce base in the early 1980s, and latter physical evidence and personal testimonies provided by Castello and others, there has predictably been intense criticism of the evidence supporting the Dulce base hypothesis. These criticisms fall into three categories. First are criticisms of physical evidence such as Bennewitz's intercepted electronic transmissions, communication transcripts, photos, video recordings, and the 'Dulce Papers' provided by Castello; and lack of physical evidence of an underground base in terms of entrances, air vents, etc. Second, are criticisms that focus on the credibility of Bennewitz, Castello, and Schneider as reliable sources for the Dulce base hypothesis. Finally, there are criticisms that the whole Dulce underground base hypothesis is a clever disinformation strategy launched by intelligence services such as the Air Force Office of Special Intelligence (AFOSI) to divide the UFO community. I will examine each of these criticisms in turn.

As far as the Bennewitz evidence was concerned, his photographs and films from 1980 clearly demonstrated some anomalous phenomenon that was acknowledged even by Air Force Intelligence, but the difficulty lay in conclusively showing what these showed. [56] Nevertheless, many UFO researchers believed this was some of the strongest evidence yet discovered of UFO's captured on film. [57] Bennewitz electronic communications while again demonstrating something odd was occurring was subject to most controversy and was again not conclusive proof. As far as the physical evidence found in the Dulce Papers was concerned, most researchers simply didn't take these seriously and assumed they were part of the disinformation campaign against Bennewitz. The lack of conclusive proof by way of photos, videos, and physical sights is reminiscent of the entire history of the UFO community's efforts to find sufficient evidence to persuade even the most skeptical of professionals. [58] This suggests that the validity of physical evidence surrounding Bennewitz's electronic records of UFO activity and ET communication, and the Dulce Papers, will continue to be subject to debate. A clear conclusion over what the physical evidence provided for the existence of the Dulce base is therefore elusive. Private investigators have explored the terrain where the underground base is allegedly located. The Archuletta Mesa is situated on Jicarilla Apache Indian reservation land. One investigator, Glen Campbell, found that there were no visible security restrictions on the land, no evidence of a military presence,

and no concealed entrances, air vents, water intakes from the nearby Navaho river, etc., were found. He subsequently concluded that there was no physical evidence of an underground base. [59] Other field investigators, however, have found evidence of strange occurrences in the area lending support to the existence of a base. [60] For instance, Norio Harakaya visited Dulce with a Japanese film production crew in 1990 and concluded:

13. I've been to Dulce with the Nippon Television Network crew and interviewed many, many people over there and came back with the firm conviction that something was happening around 10 to 15 years ago over there, including nightly sightings of strange lights and appearances of military jeeps and trucks. [61] Some of the criticisms raised by Campbell might be explained in a number of ways. Castello and Schneider, for example, both described an extensive underground infrastructure that used advanced technology such as a high-speed rail link. [62] This would make it possible for entrances to the Dulce base to be concealed in more secure areas. Also, air circulation and water could also be provided in other ways by those possessing the advanced technology to do so. This suggests that criticism of a lack of physical evidence on Jicarilla Apache land to support the idea of a secret underground base is not conclusive, and even conflicts with other testimonies of mysterious military troop movements and anomalous sightings in the area. The covert disinformation campaign launched by AFOSI against Bennewitz suggests that the physical evidence he had of an underground base in the area, and the public support he attracted, were perceived to be a national security threat. This covert disinformation campaign that began in 1980 suggests that criticisms of the physical evidence provided by Bennewitz and Castello, are not conclusive and may themselves be part of an ongoing disinformation campaign. Consequently, criticism of the lack of physical evidence for the existence of an underground base in Dulce fails to dismiss the Dulce base hypothesis. The second set of criticisms focus on the credibility of the whistleblowers/witnesses who provided evidence or testimony of the Dulce base. Establishing credibility in a field rife with disinformation, intimidation and official efforts to discredit expert witnesses and 'whistleblowers' requires some flexibility in analyzing whistleblower behavioral and/or personality characteristics. A 'nervous breakdown', 'refusal to give interviews', or use of 'cover identities', for instance, may be more of a result of covert intimidation than a sign of an individual who lacks credibility. Focusing on the mental or health problems encountered by whistleblowers/witnesses advocating the Dulce base hypothesis may amount to little more than veiled personal attacks against the credibility of the principle advocates of the hypothesis. For instance, in an online article that is critical of evidence for the Dulce base, the writer Roy Lawhon, glosses over the challenges faced in establishing the credibility of the three principal witnesses/whistleblowers advocating the Dulce Underground base hypothesis - Bennewitz, Castello, and Schneider. Lawhon finishes his description of their respective claims with references to a range of personal problems or behaviors each exhibited in a way that appears to be little more than a veiled attack on their credibility. [63] For example, he refers to Bennewitz being "committed for a time to a mental hospital", and then becoming a "reclusive, refusing to talk about UFOs." [64] As mentioned earlier, Bennewitz became the subject of an intense disinformation campaign, public scrutiny, attacks on his credibility, and unusual activities being directed against him that finally led to him having a nervous breakdown. This doesn't affect the quality of his material nor his credibility, but only displays that in intense circumstances, many individuals succumb to the psychological

pressure that has been directed against them. Moving on to Castello, Lawhon concludes that Castello “has only provided stories, nothing solid, and has yet to come forward in person,” and that there “is some doubt as to whether he actually exists.” [65] While only a relatively few researchers can vouch for Castello’s existence, there would be a very good reason to believe that as a possible whistleblower revealing classified information, he would be subject to arrest or other official efforts to ‘silence’ him if he emerged into the public. This may explain his mysterious movement while at the same time leaving open the possibility that he is part of a disinformation strategy. Therefore, while his testimony and the Dulce Papers on their own lack persuasiveness, they become significant as supporting evidence for Bennewitz’s claims. Finally, with regard to Schneider, Lawhon refers to unquoted sources that Schneider “had severe brain damage and was also a paranoid schizophrenic.” [66] This would have to be the most unfair of the criticisms raised by Lawhon. Schneider spent nearly two years on the lecture circuit (1993-95) candidly revealing his activities while an employee for corporations that built the Dulce and other underground bases. There were ample opportunities for his integrity and mental resilience to be tested, and it appears that he did not disappoint his growing number of supporters. [67] He gave the appearance of a man who knew his life would soon end from either natural causes (he had terminal cancer) or from being murdered. His apparent ‘suicide’ had the telltale signs of murder that were not seriously pursued by public authorities. [68] Schneider’s testimony represents the most solid whistleblower disclosure available on the existence of the Dulce Base and of a firefight between ETs and elite US troop shaving that occurred there in 1979. In conclusion, criticisms of the credibility of the principal advocates of the Dulce base hypothesis fail to be persuasive. Finally, there are criticisms that focus on William Moore’s 1989 declaration at a MUFON conference that he had been co-opted into a covert effort by AFOSI to feed disinformation to Bennewitz in order to discredit him. While furious that one UFO researcher would actively participate in a disinformation campaign against another researcher, many UFO researchers were quick to accept Moore’s story that the most bizarre aspects of Bennewitz’s claims, human rights abuses involving ET abductions, cold storage of humans, and underground vats filled with cattle and human parts were disinformation. Bennewitz’s claims had been gaining widespread support in the UFO community and being championed by controversial individuals such as John Lear, William Cooper, and William Hamilton. Some well-established UFO researchers believed that Lear’s and Hamilton’s claims, reflecting Bennewitz’s statements about the Dulce underground base, would damage legitimate UFO research. [69] When it was learned that John Lear had been invited to host the 1989 Mutual UFO Network (MUFON)

14. conference, for instance, prominent MUFON members began to resign in protest. [70] Many UFO researchers did not believe that Bennewitz’s electronic interceptions, interpretations of the data, and interviews with abductees, were sufficient proof of an underground ET base at Dulce. Bennewitz’s claims of ETs committing gross human rights violations at the base were widely dismissed as little more than disinformation even by those who believed in his integrity and the quality of the hard evidence he had compiled. [71] As far as the view that disinformation played a major role in Bennewitz developing his views concerning the base and human rights abuses, Bennewitz had already compiled an extensive database of information based on his two years of electronic surveillance prior to approaching AFOSI in 1980. Consequently, Bennewitz had already developed many of his views about Dulce before AFOSI began to feed him

disinformation after Bennewitz's 1980 AFOSI interviews and subsequent meeting with Moore in 1982. It is likely that Bennewitz's observation of UFO/ET activity in the area, electronic monitoring of radio and video transmissions, and his electronic communications, leading up to and including the Dulce war, gave him an overall picture of what was occurring in the base. The more likely explanation is that US intelligence services were in damage control mode after Bennewitz's intercepts of electronic communications between ET ships and the Dulce base. The even more revealing evidence and testimony provided by Castello, and later by Schneider, became intertwined with disinformation that was actively being fed into the public debate surrounding the Dulce base hypothesis. Criticism that the most alarming aspects of the Dulce base hypothesis, ET human rights abuses, etc., were simply AFOSI disinformation, fails to take into account how disinformation is actively used as a standard tool by the intelligence community to create confusion and prevent discovery of what is precisely occurring. [72] I now return to the three possibilities raised earlier concerning the Dulce underground base hypothesis: 1. the physical evidence, whistleblower claims and witness testimonies provide conclusive evidence of the Dulce base and extensive ET abuses of abducted civilians; 2. claims of the base are likely accurate but some disinformation has occurred as far as the more extreme stories of human rights abuses, and 3. the Dulce base hypothesis is disinformation. Based on the evidence presented thus far, and the lack of conclusive criticism of this evidence, the third possibility can be dismissed. This suggests the conclusion that a secret joint government-ET base did exist at Dulce, that military conflict did occur over issues that remain open to debate, but most likely involved perceptions of a treaty violation by one or both sides. Reports of gross human rights abuses against civilians abducted for various projects at the base while not at this point conclusive have sufficient evidentiary support to warrant further investigation on the part of responsible government authorities and human rights organizations. One further issue to be examined for understanding the human rights and political implications of the evidence presented thus far is to identify how Dulce and any similar bases are funded without legislative oversight. Funding Dulce and other Joint Government/ET Underground Bases without US Congressional Oversight According to Phil Schneider, funds used for the construction of underground bases in the US and elsewhere come from a 'black budget' - money that is not part of the normal Congressional appropriations and supplemental processes that fund government agencies in the US. In his 1995 lecture, Schneider declared: The Black Budget is a secretive budget that garners 25% of the gross national product of the United States. The Black Budget currently consumes \$1.25 trillion per year. At least this amount is used in black programs, like those concerned with deep underground military bases. Presently, there are 129 deep underground military bases in the United States. [73] These bases according to Schneider are "connected by high-speed magneto-leviton trains that have speeds up to Mach 2". [74] Thomas Castello also described the high-speed underground rail system that connected Dulce to other bases in the US and the world: "[the] world wide network is called the "Sub-Global System." It has "check points" at each country entry. There ARE shuttle tubes that shoot the trains at incredible speeds using a mag-lev and vacuum method. They travel at a speed that excels the speed of sound." [75] A researcher confirming some of Schneider's and Castello's claims of a vast underground infrastructure linked by a high-speed Maglev train system is Dr. Richard Sauder who has investigated and identified secret underground bases in the US and around the

globe. [76] If Schneider's description and budget estimates are correct, then a massive secret underground infrastructure exists that is funded in ways that escape Congressional oversight despite the underground infrastructure's vast size and consumption of economic resources. It is, therefore, worth investigating whether Schneider's estimate could be accurate, how Congress exercises oversight over classified programs in the US, and where a base such as Dulce fits into the overall picture of Congressional funding and oversight of clandestine military programs. Confirmation of Schneider's surprisingly high estimate of the 'black budget' comes from an unlikely source. A former Assistant Secretary of Housing and Urban Development (HUD), Catherine Fitts, claims that a total of 3.3 trillion dollars was siphoned out of HUD and the Department of Defense (DoD) for the fiscal years 1998, 1999, and 2000. [77] Fitts bases her 2000 estimate on a report from David K. Steensma, Acting Assistant Inspector for auditing DoD who wrote in a 2002 report that "DoD processed \$1.1 trillion in unsupported accounting entries to DoD Component financial data used to prepare departmental reports and DoD financial statements for FY 2000." [78] Reporting on the missing DoD funds in fiscal year 2000, investigative reporter Kelly O'Meara also supported Fitts finding:

15. [T]he deputy IG [Inspector General] at the Pentagon read an eight-page summary of DOD fiduciary failures. He admitted that \$4.4 trillion in adjustments to the Pentagon's books had to be cooked to compile the required financial statements and that \$1.1 trillion of that amount could not be supported by reliable information. In other words, at the end of the last full year, on Bill Clinton's watch, more than \$1 trillion was simply gone and no one can be sure of when, where or to whom the money went. [79] If the 'black budget' is indeed as high as Fitts' and Schneider's estimates, then it is very likely that these are used to fund programs such as the Dulce base which would appear to fall into the category of a 'Special Access Program' (SAP). SAPs are programs that have additional security measures attached to them over and above the normal classificatory system (confidential, secret, top-secret) attached to most classified information and programs. [80] According to a 1997 Senate Commission Report, there were approximately 150 SAPs that operated with DoD approval. [81] These SAPs are divided into two classes 'acknowledged' and 'unacknowledged' as described in the Senate Report: Publicly acknowledged programs are considered distinct from unacknowledged programs, with the latter colloquially referred to as "black" programs because their very existence and purpose are classified. Among black programs, a further distinction is made for "waived" programs, considered to be so sensitive that they are exempt from standard reporting requirements to Congress. The chairperson, ranking member, and, on occasion, other members and staff of relevant Congressional committees are notified only orally of the existence of these programs. [82] Essentially, a waived unacknowledged SAP (deep black) is so sensitive that only eight members of Congress (the chairs and ranking members of the four defense committees divided between the House of Representatives and Senate) are notified of a waived SAP without being given any information about it. This would enable them to truthfully declare no knowledge of such a program if asked, thereby maintaining the secrecy of this SAP. If unacknowledged SAPs are 'black programs', then 'waived' unacknowledged SAPs are 'deep black'. The Dulce base appears to be a candidate for one of these 'deep black' programs currently in operation in the US. SAPs are funded in a manner that fulfills federal guidelines and subject to both Executive and Congressional oversight. In practice though, Congressional oversight in the case of waived acknowledged SAPs

is nominal. President Clinton's Executive Order # 12958 issued on April 17, 1995, reformed how SAPs would in the future be created and oversight established. The main components of the Executive Order was that only the Secretaries of State, Defense and Energy, and the Director of Central Intelligence (or their principal deputies) could create ASAP; these would be kept to an "absolute minimum"; and would be created when "the vulnerability of, or threat to, specific information is exceptional," and their secrecy cannot be protected by the normal classification system. [83] As far as oversight was concerned, the key clause in the Executive Order was an effort by the Clinton administration to coordinate oversight through a central executive office (Information Security Oversight Office) that would be responsible to the National Security Council (NSC) and annually report to the President: (3) ... the Director of the Information Security Oversight Office shall be afforded access to these programs, in accordance with the security requirements of each program, in order to perform the functions assigned to the Information Security Oversight Office under this order. An agency head may limit access to a special access program to the Director and no more than one other employee of the Information Security Oversight Office; or, for special access programs that are extraordinarily sensitive and vulnerable, to the Director only. [84] In practice, however, effective oversight of SAP's is performed by a DoD committee, the Special Access Program Oversight Committee (SAPOC), and a similar committee in the intelligence community, Controlled Access Program Oversight Committee (CAPOC) for its SAPs, rather than the Information Security Oversight Office. [85] It is SAPOC that has the authority for the "approval, termination, revalidation, restructuring procedures for DoD special access programs." [86] Essentially, there is very little authority that a US President can exercise over SAPs in the DoD and the intelligence community. [87] The oversight system that has evolved effectively excludes the President from having control over the DoD and intelligence committees that have real power over SAPs, but which in theory are subordinate to the President as 'Commander in Chief'. [88] It will be argued that those branches of the Executive Office that are under the direct control of the President, as President Clinton discovered, have little power to influence or provide oversight of 'deep black programs.' [89] Those branches of the Executive Office that deal with ET affairs are embedded in the National Security Council and are not under the control of the President. [90] To distinguish between these as far as Executive Office oversight of deep black programs is concerned, I will refer to those executive offices under the control of the President as 'Executive Office oversight', and those offices not under the President's control as 'Shadow Government' oversight. The 'deep black' programs described by Schneider require funds well in excess of the federal funds officially allocated to SAPs. For example, in the 2001 financial year, somewhere between \$10-12 billion dollars was budgeted for SAPs by all services in the DoD, well below the sums mentioned by Schneider and Fitts that were likely being spent on the 'deep black programs' that were not included in the list of SAPs submitted to Congress. [91] Even with the increase of the DoD budget to 380 billion

16. dollars in 2003, the portion allocated to SAPs would rise only marginally thereby maintaining a large discrepancy between the actual cost of all 'deep black programs' and the budget allocated to them. To fund 'deep black programs,' that are directly connected with the ET presence without attracting Congressional and Executive Office oversight, clandestine organizations embedded in the military and intelligence branches of government have developed

a complex financial system for circumventing the normal appropriations process and oversight requirements for the use of Federal funds. According to Kelly O'Meara, the use of a range of accounting mechanisms such as "unsupported entries," "material-control weakness," "adjusted records," "unmatched disbursements," "abnormal balances" and "unreconciled differences" the DoD effectively cannot account for up to a trillion dollars annually. [92] The huge unaccounted annual sum, well in excess of the DoD's official budget suggests that federal government departments are being used to siphon money without the US taxpayer, Congress, and responsible federal authorities being aware of what is occurring. [93] Rather than siphoned federal money going directly into the pockets or Swiss bank accounts of corrupt US politicians, a practice the leaders in many developing nations have developed to a fine art, the money goes directly into the 'black budget' which then funds 'deep black programs' in addition to the official list of SAPs that can be run without Congressional and Presidential oversight. These 'illegal' funds are channeled to clandestine organizations in the different branches of the US military and intelligence services to directly fund their pet 'black programs' for dealing with the ET presence. These funds are then used to award contracts to US corporations such as EG&G, Westinghouse, McDonnell Douglas, Morrison- Knudson, Wackenhut Security Systems, Boeing Aerospace, Lorimar Aerospace, Aerospacial in France, Mitsubishi Industries, Rider Trucks, Bechtel, Raytheon, DynCorp, Lockheed Martin, Hughes, Dryden, SAC, and others that provide the necessary services for ET related projects. [94] Retired DIA intelligence officer, John Maynard reports on the nature of the relationship between corporations and the DoD: The Department of Defense has had an ongoing program since the mid-1950s, which provided contracts to U.S. Civilian Contractors/Organizations/Corporations that worked in the intelligence community. These projects came under very tight security and usually were very highly compartmentalized. What this means is that you have several concentric circles: the closer you are to the inner circle the more information you could find on the project. The further you get away from this inner circle, the less information is available. All this is established on a very strict need-to-know basis. Within these circles you could, if you looked hard enough, find contractors that worked on various parts of the project but really had no idea what the overall project was. This also happened with the military's interaction with the primary contractor. Also in this respect, each military branch had certain projects that came under the compartmentalization security measures. [95] Corporations awarded military contracts generated from illegal 'black budget' funds are not subject to Congressional or Executive Office oversight, do not have to disclose to the general public the true nature of the activities they perform for their military employers and force their employees to sign non-disclosure agreements with severe penalties. According to Bob Lazar his true employer while at the S-4 Nevada facility was the US Navy, but he had to sign a contract with the company EG&G which involved signing away his constitutional rights in the case of disclosure. [96] After his decision to quit his work at area S-4 Lazar disclosed that he received death threats. An estimate of the number of 'deep black programs' funded by the 'black budget' can be gained by using estimates of the official funding for deep black programs, and then revising this up when funds available through the 'black budget' are used. According to Executive Order 12958 and recommendations from the 1997 Senate Commission Report, the number of deep black programs (unacknowledged waived Special Access Programs) is to be kept to an absolute minimum. This suggests that of the 150 SAPs identified by the Senate

Commission in 1997, it can be estimated from proportionally breaking this down into 'acknowledged' and 'unacknowledged', and then breaking 'unacknowledged' down into 'waived' and 'unwaived' SAPs, and then using an arbitrary figure of 50% to factor in the 'absolute minimum' requirement that is used for permitting waived SAPs, that somewhere in the range of 15-20 SAPs (approximately 10% of the total) are 'deep black'. Using the same process to break down the estimated annual budget for SAPs of 10-12 billion dollars, approximately 1.5 billion dollars are annually spent on 'deep black programs'. This means that approximately 1.5 billion dollars are spent on approximately 15-20 'deep black' programs whose existence is verbally reported to only eight Congressional committee chairs & ranking members who are not briefed on them. The extraordinary security precautions surrounding 'deep black' programs have been historically acceptable to Congressional leaders based on their belief of the limited number and modest budgets allocated to these programs – \$ 1.5 billion would be less than 0.5% of the total DoD budget for 2003 (\$380 billion). If the estimates provided by Fitts, O'Meara, and Schneider are correct, then the true size of the budget for 'deep black programs' is almost three times the annual DoD budget! Comparing this astounding figure to the \$1.5 billion estimate for 'deep black' programs supplied to Congressional leaders, this suggests that waived SAPs, together with unacknowledged SAPs, are really only a cover for an entirely different category of deep black programs – those that are directly related to the ET presence.

17. Using Fitts estimates as closer to the true size of the 'black budget' and the estimate for the waived SAPs budget (\$1.5 billion), the total actual funding for this different category of 'deep black programs' can actually be multiplied by a factor of approximately 700. This might suggest that the number of 'deep black programs' could also be increased by this factor, however, the extra funding might well be used to expand each program rather than add new programs. Consequently, if a factor of ten is used to account for an expansion of a 'deep black program' to get a closer approximation of the program's actual cost, then the true number of 'deep black programs' would be expanded by a factor of 70. If an estimate of the 'official' number of 'deep black programs' is 15-20, then the true number is somewhere in the range of 1,050 to 1,400. It can be therefore concluded that over 1,000 'deep black programs' are funded by a 'black budget' estimated to be in the vicinity of 1.1 trillion dollars annually. Given that the Senate Commission reported the existence of approximately 150 SAPs in total, it can be further concluded that Congressional leaders and the President are not informed of the true number of deep black programs that exist, nor of the 'black budget' that funds more than 99% of these 'deep black' programs. If the 'black budget' is what funds the Dulce underground base and the other approximately 99% of deep black programs that are not reported to Congress even in the perfunctory manner of 'waived unacknowledged SAPs', then it is clear there are two types of deep black programs. Those funded from the regular budget (waived unacknowledged SAPs) that are constitutionally legal, and those funded by the 'black budget' that are not part of the SAP oversight process at all, are outside of the normal constitutional process and are technically illegal. It can be concluded that the legal 'deep black programs' are merely a cover for the illegal 'deep black programs' that are specifically oriented towards responding to the ET presence. These cover programs are designed to steer Congressional and Executive Office officials away from the truth about the ET-related 'deep black programs' that exist and which consume enormous resources from the US economy. Consequently, approximately 15-20 (2%) of all deep black programs are legal with a known oversight process, while approximately 750 – 1000 (98%) are illegal and have a very different oversight process. It is possible that the DoD and Intelligence community committees (SAPOC & CAPOC) that have direct oversight of legal

‘deep black programs’ are aware of illegal ‘deep black programs’ but do not effectively have oversight of these. It is likely that the main responsibility of SAPOC & CAPOC is to ensure that legal ‘deep black programs’ and acknowledged ‘black programs’ whose details are supplied to Congressional committees and the Executive Office, are effective covers for the illegally funded deep black programs. Oversight of illegal deep black programs is most likely directly exercised by clandestine organizations embedded in the various military services, Intelligence branches, and the National Security Council responsible for managing ET affairs. [97] Clandestine organizations embedded within Executive Office agencies such as the National Security Council, Federal Emergency Management Agency, and Homeland Security, form the ‘shadow government’ responsible for coordinating military, intelligence, and governmental activities that deal with ET affairs. [98] In conclusion, the funding for the construction and running of joint government-ET underground bases at Dulce and elsewhere in the US comes from ‘black budget’ funds that are not subject to the normal oversight requirements associated with regular DoD and intelligence community SAPs. The US corporations awarded contracts for providing their services to the military and intelligence agencies are unregulated, and have been very ‘successful’ in enforcing secrecy upon their employees – a critical factor in receiving future military contracts! Effectively this means that clandestine organizations embedded in the military, intelligence community, and National Security agencies, have found a way of circumventing Congressional and Executive Office oversight and approval for the true cost and number of illegal ‘deep black programs’. Table 1. Summary of Funding and Oversight System for Deep Black Programs

Program	Estimated Funding	Estimated ET Classification
Special Access /CAPOC/Executive Intelligence Office Community Program (SAP) Unacknowledged	Congress*/SAPOC 75 Congress/DoD/ \$5 - 6 billion	No
Black Government Acronyms SAPOC – Special Access Program Oversight Committee, Department of Defense CAPOC – Controlled Access Program Oversight Committee, CAPOC*Congress Committees – House National Security Committee, the Senate Armed Services Committee, and the defense subcommittees of the House and Senate Appropriations committees.	Congress*/SAPOC 55-60 Congress/DoD/ \$3.5 - 4.5 billion	Cover
18. Unacknowledged Intelligence Community SAP - Deep Black Illegal – Deep Shadow	1050-1400 Black Budget \$1.1 trillion	Yes

Office Intelligence Community Waived SAPOC/CAPOC 15-20 Congress/DoD/ \$1.5 billion Cover

18. Unacknowledged Intelligence Community SAP - Deep Black Illegal – Deep Shadow 1050-1400 Black Budget \$1.1 trillion Yes Black Government Acronyms SAPOC – Special Access Program Oversight Committee, Department of Defense CAPOC – Controlled Access Program Oversight Committee, CAPOC*Congress Committees – House National Security Committee, the Senate Armed Services Committee, and the defense subcommittees of the House and Senate Appropriations committees. Michael E. Salla, Ph.D. The Dulce Report (September 2003) Conclusion: Political Implications of Alleged Human Rights Abuses at Dulce The whistleblower testimonies examined in this report persuasively point to the existence of the Dulce base as a former and/or current joint US government-ET underground facility built with ‘black budget’ funds that operated/operates without Congressional and Executive Office oversight. The testimonies further support the view that the ‘Dulce war’ did involve armed conflict between US military forces, Base Security Personnel, and resident ET races. While the precise cause of the military confrontation remains unclear, it does suggest that one or both sides were not keeping commitments specified in an undisclosed treaty. Given whistleblower testimony that one of these treaty commitments was ensuring that abducted civilians used in genetic experiments undertaken at the base would be fully accounted for, not harmed, and safely returned to civilian life, there is cause to believe gross human rights violations may have played a role in sparking the conflict. Similar human rights abuses may well be occurring in other possible joint government-ET bases in the US and other countries around the planet. The immediate political fallout from the ‘Dulce Wars’ and alleged ET abuses of abducted civilians was very likely an indefinite delay in public disclosure of the ET presence. The release of the Steven Spielberg movie Close Encounters of the Third Kind in 1977 has been long speculated to have been part of an ‘acclimation program’ to prepare the general public for disclosure of the ET presence. [99] NASA sent a 20-page confidential letter to Spielberg outlining what should and shouldn’t be in the movie prior to its release suggesting an unusual degree of official interest in how ETs

and the government were depicted.[100] The 1979 'Dulce War' where the clandestine authorities in charge of ET affairs (the shadow government) ordered an attack on EToccupied levels of a joint underground base would surely have signaled a dramatic shift in attitudes towards the ET presence and an indefinite hold on full public disclosure. There is sufficient evidence to justify further investigation into the accuracy of claims surrounding extensive human rights abuses at joint government-ET bases that exist(ed) at Dulce and elsewhere in the US. The most effective means of exploring alleged human rights abuses at Dulce would be for a prominent human rights non-government organization such as AmnestyInternational or Human Rights Watch to initiate an investigation of the claims surrounding such abuses. These organizations have extensive experience in performing accurate and confidential investigations in countries that have historically conducted gross human rights, and repressed those who have stepped forward to reveal such abuses. An investigation by a human rights NGO could provide the opportunity for whistleblowers to step forward and/or pass information concerning alleged human rights abuses at Dulce. This would provide a means of preserving confidentially and preventing criminal charges against whistleblowers for disclosing 'classified information'. In the case of criminal charges being brought against such whistleblowers by US federal agencies, or of their disappearance, such individuals could become the focus of 'emergency alerts' that human rights organizations have pioneered over the years to secure the release of those revealing 'human rights' abuses. Another means of exploring alleged human rights abuses at Dulce would be for a Congressionally backed inquiry into allegations of such abuses and the full scope of activities at these underground facilities examined in terms of the degree to which they contributed to human rights abuses. Comprehensive congressional immunity and protection should be given to all government/military officials and employees of corporations willing to step forward to give information of human rights abuses of US citizens and other nationals in bases on US territory or around the globe. Due to high public interest in learning about such alleged abuses, the Congressional inquiry should be open with full media coverage. Where genuine national security